

PUNJAB STATE INFORMATION COMMISSION

RED CROSS BUILDING, NEAR ROSE GARDEN,

SECTOR 16, CHANDIGARH.

Ph: 0172-2864112, Email: - psic23@punjabmail.gov.in

Visit us: - www.infocommpunjab.com; Helpline No. 0172-2864100



{Encl. Pg.1} Dr. Narendra Nath Ganguly, (9435043449)

M.S. PhD, Associate Professor of Surgery,
JMC, Jorhat, Assam.

R/o 12, Jyoti Prasad Agarwala, Bye Lane,
Bishnurabha Path, Beltola, Guwahti - 781028.

.....Appellant/Complainant

Versus

Public Information Officer

O/o Christian Medical College,
Ludhiana.

.....Respondent

First Appellate Authority

O/o Convener, MCI Nodal Centre, C/o Christian Medical College,
Ludhiana.

Appeal Case No. 2164 of 2021

RTI application filed on	:	18-03-2020
PIO replied on	:	11-05-2021
First appeal filed on	:	26-06-2020
First Appellate Authority order	:	10-07-2020

Present: Appellant: Advocate Firuz Khan (On telephone call)

Respondent: Advocate Brighu Dutt Sharma, 9814245156

ORDER (Fifth Hearing)

1. This order may be read with the reference of previous order of the Commission dated 09.05.2022

Information Sought

1. What was the ground for rejecting my application?
2. Did you communicate with the RC or the Education Department of the JMC before deciding about the selection?
3. Don't you think that this selection was arbitrary and biased? If not then explain please.
4. Don't you think that the trainings are more necessary for the teachers of the treating branches of Medical science, who teach to produce treating doctors?
5. Why did you choose the other applicant over mine?
6. What did you mean by Overwhelming Response and how did you decide in such a situation? Tossing a coin? Draw a card? If neither then please describe how?
7. If both the applications reached you with a common mail, how did you decide the candidature? Please elaborate selection procedure during overwhelming response.

2. **Written Submission from respondent:** With the compliance of the previous order of the Commission the respondent has made a written submission in affidavit form the relevant portion of which is reproduced below:

PUNJAB STATE INFORMATION COMMISSION

RED CROSS BUILDING, NEAR ROSE GARDEN,

SECTOR 16, CHANDIGARH.

Ph: 0172-2864112, Email: - psic23@punjabmail.gov.in

Visit us: - www.infocommpunjab.com; Helpline No. 0172-2864100



Appeal Case No. 2164 of 2021

"Affidavit of Professor Dr. Monika Sharma, Christian Medical

College, Brown Road, Ludhiana

I, the above named deponent do hereby solemnly affirm and declare as under:

1. That the present affidavit is being filed in compliance of the order dated 09.05.2022 passed by this Hon'ble Commission.

That the deponent affirms and declares that the deponent does not withdraw any salary from National Medical Commission (formerly Medical Council of India) at all."

3. The Commission has decided to adjourn the matter for the time being. To come up on 05.09.2022 through cisco webex at 11:00 am.

{Steps: Install Cisco Webex < Click on Join Meeting< Write Meeting No. – 1581884645 }

Chandigarh
Dated: 21.06.2022

(Maninder Singh Patti)
State Information Commissioner, Pb.

PUNJAB STATE INFORMATION COMMISSION

RED CROSS BUILDING, NEAR ROSE GARDEN,

SECTOR 16, CHANDIGARH.

Ph: 0172-2864112, Email: - psic23@punjabmail.gov.in

Visit us: - www.infocommpunjab.com; Helpline No. 0172-2864100



Sh. Amarjit Singh Dhamotia, (9888490031)

Whistle blower Social Worker,

Distt. President Ludhiana - NCAG,

House No. 60-35 -P-376-1, Street No. 8, Maha Singh Nagar,

P.O Dhandari Kalan, Ludhiana – 141014

.....Appellant/Complainant

Versus

Public Information Officer

.....Respondent

O/o S.H.O, Police Station, Daba,

Ludhiana.

CC: Shri Mehma Singh Sadar Police station Patiala

First Appellate Authority

O/o S.H.O, Police Station, Daba,

Ludhiana.

Appeal Case No. 1583,1584 & 1596 of 2021

Present: Appellant: Sh. Amarjit Singh Dhamotia

Respondent: Sh. Gurbaj Singh (ASI), 8728889777

ORDER:

1. This order may be read with the reference of previous order of the Commission dated 18.05.2022 and 10.05.2022. As both parties are same, therefore a single speaking order is being passed in all the above mentioned cases.

2. OBSERVATION:

Respondent, Sh. Gurbaj Singh appeared clueless in respect of the nuances of the RTI Act and appeared without proper explanation for non compliance of the previous orders of the Commission. He stated that as he has been newly appointed to this police station and all other staff are also new therefore the delay occurred in dealing this RTI application.

A strict warning is issued to the S.H.O, Police Station, Daba Ludhiana for not providing any satisfactory reply to the appellant within the timeline prescribed under the Act. The

PIOs are warned to be careful with the timeline and refrain from delaying replies.

3. DECISION :

The PIO Shri Amrinder Singh SHO PS Daba ludhiana is directed to provide a point wise reply to the appellant , pertaining to the information sought in his RTI application within 30 days from the date of receipt of this order. A compliance report to this effect shall be sent to the Commission by the PIO.

PUNJAB STATE INFORMATION COMMISSION

RED CROSS BUILDING, NEAR ROSE GARDEN,

SECTOR 16, CHANDIGARH.

Ph: 0172-2864112, Email: - psic23@punjabmail.gov.in

Visit us: - www.infocommpunjab.com; Helpline No. 0172-2864100



1/2

Appeal Case No. 1583,1584 & 1596 of 2021

Commission also notes that the then PIO has not taken full and complete action as per the directions of the previous orders of the Commission. Accordingly Commission directs that the compensation of Rs. 1000/- be paid to the appellant by the public authority in terms of section 19(8)(b) of the Act. The compensation amount of RS.1000/- must be paid by the concerned PIO through cheque and demand draft in favour of appellant Sh. Amarjit Singh Dhamotia from the account of public authority and not from individual account. **The PIO is also therefore, warned to be extremely careful and vigilant in handling RTI petitions in future, failing which the Commission would initiate disciplinary action .**

The Commission would like to place on record its displeasure to **the then PIO**, Inspector Mehma Singh, SHO., who is presently posted in Sadar Police station Patiala over the casual manner in which the RTI application had been dealt with by the Respondent. Since the then PIO has failed to comply with the order of the Commission, without a valid reason, he is liable to be penalized under Section 20(1) of the RTI Act. The Commission imposes a penalty of Rs. 25000/- on Inspector Mehma Singh, under Section 20(1) of the RTI which is to be deducted from his salary in two monthly installments.

Deposit penalty amount of Rs. 25000/- in the State Treasury in the following Head of Account :-

0070- Other Administrative Services

- **60 – Other Services**
- **0800 – Other Receipts**
- **86-Fee under the RTI Act, 2005**

and to report its compliance to Commission, before the next date of hearing.

4. A final opportunity is given to respondent PIO to submit a written reply and to be present the case in person, on the next date of hearing dated 19.07.2022 at 11:30 am in PSIC Chandigarh.

NOTE: The PIO Shri Amrinder Singh SHO PS Daba ludhiana has to be present on next date of hearing.

Chandigarh
Dated: 21.06.2022

(Maninder Singh Patti)
State Information Commissioner, Pb.

2/2

PUNJAB STATE INFORMATION COMMISSION

RED CROSS BUILDING, NEAR ROSE GARDEN,

SECTOR 16, CHANDIGARH.

Ph: 0172-2864112, Email: - psic23@punjabmail.gov.in

Visit us: - www.infocommpunjab.com; Helpline No. 0172-2864100



Sh. Pawan Kumar, (7508780269)
S/o Sh. Shiv Lal,
R/o Village Rupana,
Tehsil & District Sri Muktsar Sahib – 152032

....Appellant

Versus

Public Information Officer,
O/o Sub Divisional Engineer,
Central Works Sub Division,
PWD (B & R) Batala at Amritsar.

First Appellate Authority,
O/o Superintending Engineer,
Construction Division (B&R) Circle,
Amritsar.

....Respondents

APPEAL CASE NO. 667 OF 2022

RTI Application Dated	: 08.11.2021
Reply by the PIO	:
First Appellate Authority Dated	: 11.12.2021
Reply/Order of the FAA	: -

PRESENT: Shri Pawan Kumar, Appellant.
Shri Dilbagh Singh, S.D.E. for the Respondents (82838 28197)

ORDER:

This order may be read with the reference of previous order dated 06.06.2022.

2. The Respondent appears in person and brought the information for the perusal of the Commission and the appellant and the same is handed over to the appellant, during the hearing.

3. After going through the information, the appellant states that incomplete information has provided to him.

4. The Appellant is advised to furnish deficiencies if any, in writing to the PIO within one or two days, under intimation to the Commission. The PIO is directed to remove the same after received from the appellant.

Cont...Pg2

PUNJAB STATE INFORMATION COMMISSION

RED CROSS BUILDING, NEAR ROSE GARDEN,

SECTOR 16, CHANDIGARH.

Ph: 0172-2864112, Email: - psic23@punjabmail.gov.in

Visit us: - www.infocommpunjab.com; Helpline No. 0172-2864100



-02-

APPEAL CASE NO. 667 OF 2022

5. The PIO is directed to provide the remaining information, if any, to the appellant, before the next date of hearing. In case no other information is available in the official record, then file an **AFFIDAVIT** in this regard and produce the same before the Bench. He is further directed to **APPEAR PERSONALLY** on the next date of hearing **through CISCO WEBEX**, failing which penal consequences shall follow.

6. The matter is adjourned for **20.07.2022 at 11:00 AM through CISCO WEBEX MEETING ID No. 158 188 4645**. Both the parties are directed to present their case accordingly. Copies of the order be sent to the parties.

**Chandigarh
Patti)
21.06.2022
Commissioner**

**(Maninder Singh
State Information**